

Revive, Relive, Remember: Re-enactors and the Memory of the American Revolution



Madeline Karp
Honors Capstone
The American University
Department of History
Professor Kimberly Sims
Washington, DC
April 2010

*Dad –
You have been the most patient and enthusiastic
research assistant I could have ever asked for.
This one's for you.*

CONTENTS

Introduction

1

Research Methodology

Or, Out in the Woods with My Tri-Corn Hat and a Tape Recorder

2

Private History With A Public Option:

Bringing History, Memory and Interpretation to the People

4

You Can Recreate The War, But You Can't Fight Any Battles:

A Brief History of Re-enactment

13

Revive, Relive, Remember:

The Three R's of Public Memory and How Re-enactment Uses Each

19

Re-enactments and Re-enactors:

Who They Are, What They Do

21

Outward Homogeneity, Hidden Variations

28

Ideological Pageantry and Dramatic Patriotism

35

My Buttons are Original:

Re-enactors and Material Culture

40

Hitting the Glass Ceiling:

The Limitations of Re-enactment

51

Conclusion

57

Appendix 1 – Results for “American Revolution Re-enactors Survey”

60

Appendix 2 – Diagrams and Photographs	
65	

Bibliography	
72	

Illustrations

APPENDIX 1 – Results for “American Revolution Re-enactors Survey”

1.1	How Participants Became Involved in Re-enactment.....	60
1.2	Character Portrayals During Re-enactment Events.....	61
1.3	Ranks Held Within Re-enactment Groups.....	61
1.4	Do you work in the field of history?.....	62
1.5	Professions Held Outside the Historical Field.....	62
1.6	Number of Re-enactment Events Attended Annually.....	63
1.7	Participant Ages.....	63
1.8	Gender Breakdown.....	64
1.9	Re-enactors’ Military Experience.....	64

APPENDIX 2 – Diagrams and Photographs

2.1	Union and Confederate Veterans Reunite at Gettysburg.....	65
2.2	Edward Casey’s Four Tiers of Memory.....	65
2.3	Front Cover of the Phineas Fayette Handbook for Bicentennial Planners.....	66
2.4	Page One of the Phineas Fayette Handbook for Bicentennial Planners.....	67
2.5	Page Four of the Phineas Fayette Handbook for Bicentennial Planners.....	68
2.6	Release Forms.....	69
2.7	Officers’ Meeting.....	69
2.8	Fire!.....	70
2.9	Washington Crossing the Delaware.....	70
2.10	Delaware Crossing.....	71

Acknowledgements

This project would not have been possible without the help of so many patient, caring and talented individuals. Some enthusiastically answered what I'm sure were sometimes tedious interview questions, others patiently waited while I read out thesaurus entries to find just the right words, and everyone put up with my eleventh hour questions and crises. This thesis would not have been possible without the help of my advisor, Professor Kimberly Sims. Not only did she help me finally settle on my topic, but she also listened to many tales of research successes and woes without complaint, always trying to push me a little further in my analysis. The American University History Department and the James R. Mooney Fund were integral in helping to fund my research excursions. Without them I would not have been able to travel nearly as much as I did to conduct personal interviews. Professor Kathleen Franz introduced me to my first re-enactor and helped me get started with the interviews, and to her I am forever grateful. To Katy Jurczyk, you have been a wonderful proofreader and peer editor. Thank you for your everlasting enthusiasm and for all the discussions of who was the coolest Revolutionary. It was *totally* the Marquis de Lafayette. To Julie Oswald, you single-handedly have been the best thesis support group anyone could ever ask for. Thank you for the suggestions, the editing, the public history solidarity, and perhaps most importantly, the chocolate chip cookies and kitten therapy. I'd also like to thank the re-enactors who gamely participated in taped interview sessions and who graciously allowed me to shadow them at various re-enactment events: Sue Deeks, Travis Shaw, Matthew Murphey, John Funk, Daniel Kaluhiokalani, Adam Young, Glenn Porter, Jim McGaughey, Earl Blizzard, Asher Lurie, Richard Bowers, Mark K. Crosby, James I. Hancock-Crosby, Rex L. Hughes, Jr., Joe Wilson, Heather Vogeley, Julie Phillips, Marie Caron, Missy Stolfi, Kirk and Winnie Dreier, Chad Johnson, Michael Clark, Rich Staron, Joseph

Seymour, Bill Ochester, Jack Zarra, Jon Schmidt and April Thomas. I'm sure we'll see each other next re-enactment season. Finally, a special thanks to my father, Howard Karp, for driving up and down the eastern seaboard to take me to re-enactments, for asking questions I never would have thought up, and for always supporting my project, even when you weren't quite sure what it was about. I am greatly indebted to all of you.